



West Greenland Commission

WGC(19)03

Report on the Use of the Framework of Indicators in 2019

WGC(19)03

Report on the Use of the Framework of Indicators in 2019

1. At its Annual Meeting in Portland (Maine, USA) in June 2018, the West Greenland Commission adopted a multi-annual regulatory measure for the West Greenland salmon fishery for the years 2018 to 2020 (WGC(18)11). This regulatory measure applied to the fishery in 2018 and would be carried forward to 2019 and 2020 unless application of the Framework of Indicators (FWI) shows that there has been a significant change in the indicators used and, therefore, that a full reassessment of the management advice is required.
2. The Commission agreed that the same procedure used in previous years (2008, 2010, 2011, 2013, 2014, 2016, and 2017) should again be used in applying the FWI in 2019. Thus, a small group comprising one representative from each member of the Commission was appointed to work by correspondence to collect the data and apply the FWI (Annex 1 and 2). The appointed representatives were: Gérald Chaput (Canada), Katrine Kærgaard (Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland)), Niall Ó Maoiléidigh (European Union) and Rory Saunders (Unites States). The Group worked by correspondence to co-ordinate the data collection and apply the FWI and its report is attached
3. The overall conclusion of the FWI Working Group is that ‘the FWI does not show that there has been a significant change in the indicators used, and therefore a re-assessment of the ICES management advice for the 2019 fishery is not required’.
4. In light of the Group’s conclusions, ICES has been informed that the items relating to the provision of catch options or alternative management advice (items 3.4 (NAC) and 4.3 (WGC)) and updating of the Framework of Indicators (items 3.5 (NAC) and 4.4 (WGC)) of the Request for Scientific Advice from ICES, CNL(18)11, do not need to be addressed in 2019.
5. The arrangement for applying the FWI again appeared to work well and within the timescale proposed by the Commission. We are grateful to the FWI Working Group for its work in 2019.

Secretary
Edinburgh
18 April 2019

NASCO - WEST GREENLAND COMMISSION

REPORT OF THE FRAMEWORK OF INDICATORS WORKING GROUP 2019

Introduction:

At its Annual Meeting in Portland (Maine, USA) in June 2018, the West Greenland Commission adopted a multi-annual regulatory measure for the West Greenland salmon fishery for the years 2018 to 2020 (WGC(18)11). This regulatory measure applied to the fishery in 2018 and would be carried forward to 2019 and 2020 unless application of the Framework of Indicators (FWI) shows that there has been a significant change in the indicators used and, therefore, that a full reassessment of the management advice is required.

The Commission agreed that the same procedure used in previous years (2008, 2010, 2011, 2013, 2014, 2016, and 2017) should again be used in applying the FWI in 2019. Thus, a small group comprising one representative from each member of the Commission was appointed to work by correspondence to collect the data and apply the FWI (Annex 1 and 2). The Working Group comprised:

Gérald Chaput	Canada
Katrine Kærgaard	Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland)
Niall Ó Maoiléidigh	European Union
Rory Saunders	United States

The Group was asked to complete their tasks by January 31, 2019 and to liaise with the NASCO Secretariat who would present their findings to the Parties and to ICES.

Work of the Working Group:

Gérald Chaput agreed to act as Co-ordinator of the FWI Working Group for 2019 (Annex 3). Annex 4 summarizes the chronology of the work undertaken by the Group. A request for data to populate the FWI was circulated to representatives from each of the North American Commission “management units,” and returns were sent to the co-ordinator. The Co-ordinator then circulated the completed FWI worksheet for 2019 (Annex 5 and 6) and the draft report to the Working Group for their review and agreement.

Framework of Indicators Analysis – 2019:

ICES updated the FWI at the March 2018 meeting of the Working Group on North Atlantic Salmon and presented the updated framework analysis at the West Greenland Commission during the 2018 Annual Meeting of NASCO.

The FWI worksheet includes data from four North American Commission “management units”: USA, Scotia-Fundy, Gulf, and Quebec. Each Working Group member has reviewed the raw data and the FWI assessment spreadsheet and confirmed their agreement with the following summary of the findings for the return year 2018.

Data were provided for all the indicators in the FWI. All indicators for the 2018 return year without exception were below their threshold values, averaging 19% to 60% of their threshold values.

The assessment indicates that the Management Objectives are not expected to have been met in the four management areas included in the FWI.

Conclusions:

As ICES indicated that there was no catch option on mixed stock fisheries at West Greenland that would satisfy the management objectives, the catch option on the sheet was set to 0. The overall conclusion of the FWI Working Group is that the FWI does not show that there has been a significant change in the indicators used, and therefore a re-assessment of the ICES management advice for the 2019 fishery is not required.

FWI Working Group

4 February, 2019

Annex 1. Initial communication from NASCO to Heads of West Greenland Commission regarding application of the Framework of Indicators for 2019.

From: NASCO <hq@nasco.int>
Sent: Thursday, January 3, 2019 12:16 PM
To: Doucet, Serge; Kimberly Damon-Randall; Arnaud Peyronnet; Emanuel Rosing
Cc: MARE-B2-NASCO@ec.europa.eu; Mahoney, Derek
Subject: West Greenland Commission Framework of Indicators

To: Heads of Delegations of the West Greenland Commission
From: Secretary
Re: Framework of Indicators – West Greenland Commission

At the Thirty-Fifth Annual Meeting of the West Greenland Commission in Portland, Maine in 2018, a multi-annual regulatory measure was adopted for the West Greenland salmon fishery for the years 2018, 2019 and 2020, WGC(18)11. Under this measure, the Framework of Indicators (FWI) provided by ICES is to be applied in 2019 and 2020 to identify if there have been any significant changes to the indicators used and consequently that a reassessment of the multi-annual advice is warranted.

When the FWI was run in previous years, a small Working Group comprising one representative of each member of the Commission worked by correspondence to collate the data and apply the FWI. This task needs to be completed by the end of January 2019 and the Secretariat will liaise with the Group and present the findings to the Parties and to ICES. The members of the Group, when it was last convened in 2017 were:

Gérald Chaput	Canada
Esben Ehlers	Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland)
Niall Ó Maoiléidigh	European Union
Rory Saunders	US

We need to resolve the membership of the Group to apply the FWI in 2019, including appointing a replacement for Esben Ehlers. I would be grateful, therefore, if you could advise me of the name of your representative **by 10 January 2019**. Once the membership is resolved, the Group will be able to assemble the data and conduct its assessment.

This email should have been sent in November 2018. I am not sure why it was not but it was not. I realise that I am asking you to reply at short notice. However, the work needs to be collated by the FWI Working Group by the end of January 2019.

Kind regards,
Emma

Dr Emma Hatfield
Secretary

WGC14.1095

Annex 2. Notification of representation on the FWI Working Group 2019.

From: NASCO <hq@nasco.int>

Sent: January-11-19 10:52 AM

To: Chaput, Gerald <Gerald.Chaput@dfo-mpo.gc.ca>; Emanuel Rosing <emro@nanoq.gl>; Niall Ó Maoiléidigh <niall.omaileidigh@marine.ie>; Rory Saunders <rory.saunders@noaa.gov>

Subject: West Greenland Commission - Framework of Indicators Working Group

Dear All

We are most grateful to you all for serving on the West Greenland Commission's Framework of Indicators Working Group. There is one change from the 2017 participants. We have replaced Esben Ehlers with Emanuel Rosing as the representative of Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland) on the Group given that Emanuel is the current Head of Delegation.

The members of the Group for the 2019 assessment are as follows:

Canada	Gérald Chaput
Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland)	Emanuel Rosing
European Union	Niall Ó Maoiléidigh
USA	Rory Saunders

I would ask that you appoint a Co-ordinator to liaise with the NASCO Secretariat and that the Group's findings be reported to us no later than **31 January 2019** so that we can inform the Parties to the West Greenland Commission and ICES of your findings. Gérald Chaput served as Co-ordinator for the Group's work in 2017. I attach a copy of the Group's report from 2017, WGC(17)3.

Best regards

Emma

Dr Emma Hatfield

Secretary

WGC14.1096

Annex 3. Agreement on tasks and coordination of the FWI Working Group 2016.

From: Katrine Kærgaard <katk@nanoq.gl>
Sent: January-29-19 8:28 AM
To: Chaput, Gerald <Gerald.Chaput@dfo-mpo.gc.ca>
Subject: Sv: West Greenland Commission - Framework of Indicators Working Group (Nanoq - ID nr.: 9923545)

Dear Gerald,

I hope that this mail finds you well?

I am back in the Ministry of Fisheries, Hunting and Agriculture in Nuuk and taking over the NASCO file from Emanuel.

I have discussed this with Rasmus Nygaard and as the Kapisilit salmon is not an indicator stock - do you expect something from us on this? Unfortunately, Esben is no longer with us and I do not quite remember how this works.

Thank you in advance,

Venlig hilsen| best regards

Katrine Kærgaard

Chefkonsulent| Chief Advisor

Aalisarnermut Piniarnermut Nunalerinermullu Naalakkersuisoqarfik | Departementet for Fiskeri, Fangst og Landbrug

Ministry of Fisheries, Hunting and Agriculture

katk@nanoq.gl | +299 34 53 65

www.naalakkersuisut.gl

From: Niall O'Maoileidigh <niall.omaileidigh@marine.ie>
Sent: January-14-19 9:16 AM
To: Chaput, Gerald <Gerald.Chaput@dfo-mpo.gc.ca>; NASCO <hq@nasco.int>; Emanuel Rosing <emro@nanoq.gl>; Rory Saunders <rory.saunders@noaa.gov>
Cc: NASCO <hq@nasco.int>
Subject: RE: West Greenland Commission - Framework of Indicators Working Group

Happy New Year Gerald !!

I would be happy for you to as you suggest below as you have most hands on experience and access also to the previous versions. However, let me know if you need any assistance during the process.

Regards

NÓM

From: Chaput, Gerald
Sent: January-14-19 9:12 AM
To: 'NASCO' <hq@nasco.int>; Emanuel Rosing <emro@nanoq.gl>; Niall Ó Maoiléidigh <niall.omaileidigh@marine.ie>; Rory Saunders <rory.saunders@noaa.gov>
Cc: 'NASCO' <hq@nasco.int>
Subject: RE: West Greenland Commission - Framework of Indicators Working Group

Hello everyone,

First of all, best wishes to all for the new year 2019.

It is a bright, cold (-15 C; for Canada!) morning here, and the days are getting longer, so things are looking up.

I have taken the initiative to circulate the data request for the West Greenland Commission framework of indicators to the various jurisdictions in eastern Canada responsible for assessing the stocks.

The exception is for the US for which I have reached out to Rory to contact the appropriate group to complete the framework (however under the current situation in the US, I do not expect a response from Rory but will follow up as the situation evolves).

I would be happy to coordinate the request for input, complete the framework as input is received, and lead the report preparation for the group. But if someone else would like to do that, please do not hesitate to offer.

Attached for your information is the Excel spreadsheet of the Framework.

All the best,

Gérald Chaput

Coordinator, Centre for Science Advice, Gulf Region
Fisheries and Oceans Canada/Government of Canada
Gerald.Chaput@dfo-mpo.gc.ca / Tel: 506-851-2022

Annex 4. Summary of Correspondence by FWI Working Group 2019

Date	Contact	Action
3 Jan. 2019	Secretariat	Request to Heads of WGC for nominations to the FWI Working Group
11 Jan. 2019	Secretariat	Confirmation of membership and responsibilities of FWI Working Group
14 Jan. 2019	Group	Agreement on co-ordinator and tasks
14 Jan. 2019	Chaput	Request for data inputs sent to Canadian and USA contacts
21 Jan. 2019	Ross Jones	Data submitted to co-ordinator for SFA 23 indicators for Canada
29 Jan. 2019	Group	Group contact for Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland) confirmed as Katherine Kærgaard
29 Jan. 2019	Sophie LeBlanc	Data submitted to co-ordinator for SFA 18 indicator for Canada
30 Jan. 2019	Dustin Raab	Data submitted to co-ordinator for SFA 21 indicator for Canada
30 Jan. 2019	Scott Douglas	Data submitted to co-ordinator for SFA 16 indicators for Canada
30 Jan. 2019	Rory Saunders	Data submitted to co-ordinator for indicator for USA
31 Jan. 2019	Julien April	Data submitted to co-ordinator for indicators for Quebec
31 Jan. 2019	Chaput	Draft report circulated to FWI-WG for approval including FWI input data, FWI worksheet and draft conclusions of assessment.
1 Feb. 2019	Ó Maoiléidigh	Confirmed agreement with assessment and report on behalf of EU
4 Feb. 2019	Kærgaard	Confirmed agreement with assessment and report on behalf of Denmark (in respect of the Faroe Islands and Greenland)
4 Feb. 2019	Saunders	Confirmed agreement with assessment and report on behalf of USA
4 Feb. 2019	Chaput	Agreed Report of FWI-Working Group sent to Secretary of NASCO

Annex 5. Data inputs to 2018 for the 2019 Indicator Framework (including comments by data providers).

Geographic Area	River/ Indicator	2018 value	Comment	Provider
USA	Penobscot 2SW Returns	479	provisional estimate	Rory Saunders, Jan. 30, 2019
Scotia-Fundy	Saint John Return Large	65		Ross Jones, Jan. 21, 2019
	Lahave Return Large	113		Dustin Raab, Jan. 30, 2019
	North Return Large	91	Preliminary estimate based on recreational catch data queried January 29, 2019	Dustin Raab, Jan. 30, 2019
	Saint John Survival 2SW (%)	0	We had no 1.2 returns in 2018 so the hatchery smolt-to-2SW rate for Mactaquac was 0.000%.	Ross Jones, Jan. 21, 2019
	Saint John Survival 1SW (%)	0.248		Ross Jones, Jan. 21, 2019
	Saint John Return 1SW	451		Ross Jones, Jan. 21, 2019
	LaHave Return 1SW	72		Dustin Raab, Jan. 30, 2019
Gulf	Miramichi Return 2SW	12965	2018 return estimate for Miramichi total 18,790 x previous 5 yr avg for proportion 2SW (0.69)	Scott Douglas, Jan. 30, 2019
	Miramichi Return 1SW	8634	2018 return estimate for Miramichi total	Scott Douglas, Jan. 30, 2019
	Margaree Return Large	2264	Preliminary estimate based on recreational catch data queried January 29, 2019	Sophie LeBlanc, Jan. 29, 2019
Quebec	Bonaventure Return Large	963		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	Grande Rivière Return Large	187		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	Saint-Jean Return Large	403		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	Dartmouth Return Large	584		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	Madeleine Return Large	365		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	York Return Large	767		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	De la Trinité Return Large	87		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	De la Trinité Return Small	183		Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	Saint-Jean 2SW Survival	0.14	Preliminary value: proportion of 2SW in large salmon (63 cm and over) estimated from last five years average.	Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019
	De la Trinité 2SW Survival	0.66	Preliminary value: proportion of 2SW in large salmon (63 cm and over) estimated from last five years average.	Julien April, Jan. 30, 2019

Annex 6. Indicator Framework sheet with 2019 indicators analysis.

Catch Advice	Catch option > 0 (Yes = 1, No = 0)
--------------	---------------------------------------

0

Overall Recommendation
No Significant Change Identified by Indicators

Geographic Area	River/ Indicator	2018 Value	Ratio Value		True Low	True High	Indicator State	Probability of Correct Assignment	Indicator Score	Management Objective Met?
			Threshold	Threshold						
USA	Penobscot 2SW Returns	479	20%	2,368	100%	100%	-1	1	-1	
	<i>possible range</i>				-1.00	1.00				
	Average		20%						-1.00	No
Scotia-Fundy	Saint John Return Large	65	2%	3,329	97%	100%	-1	0.97	-0.97	
	Lahave Return Large	113	40%	285	81%	85%	-1	0.81	-0.81	
	North Return Large	91	15%	626	96%	74%	-1	0.96	-0.96	
	Saint John Survival 2SW (%)	0		0.222	96%	81%				
	Saint John Survival 1SW (%)	0.248	33%	0.763	89%	73%	-1	0.89	-0.89	
	Saint John Return 1SW	451	20%	2,276	89%	80%	-1	0.89	-0.89	
	Lahave Return 1SW	72	4%	1,679	96%	67%	-1	0.96	-0.96	
	<i>possible range</i>				-0.78	0.68				
Average		19%						-0.91	No	
Gulf	Miramichi Return 2SW	12965	88%	14,669	100%	82%	-1	1.00	-1.00	
	Miramichi Return 1SW	8634	21%	41,588	92%	68%	-1	0.92	-0.92	
	Margaree Return Large	2264	72%	3,149	88%	56%	-1	0.88	-0.88	
	<i>possible range</i>				-0.93	0.69				
Average		60%						-0.93	No	
Quebec	Bonaventure Return Large	963	65%	1,479	82%	76%	-1	0.82	-0.82	
	Grande Rivière Return Large	187	42%	442	100%	89%	-1	1.00	-1.00	
	Saint-Jean Return Large	403	53%	758	88%	78%	-1	0.88	-0.88	
	Dartmouth Return Large	584	77%	756	84%	87%	-1	0.84	-0.84	
	Madeleine Return Large	365	54%	672	88%	79%	-1	0.88	-0.88	
	York Return Large	767	55%	1405	73%	83%	-1	0.73	-0.73	
	De la Trinité Return Large	87	23%	385	82%	100%	-1	0.82	-0.82	
	De la Trinité Return Small	183	32%	578	83%	85%	-1	0.83	-0.83	
	Saint-Jean 2SW Survival	0.14	19%	0.72	100%	50%	-1	1	-1	
	De la Trinité 2SW Survival	0.66	135%	0.49	92%	68%	1	0.68	0.68	
<i>possible range</i>				-0.87	0.80					
Average		56%						-0.71	No	
Newfoundland	<i>possible range</i>									
Average									NA	Unknown
Labrador	<i>possible range</i>									
Average									NA	Unknown
Southern NEAC	<i>possible range</i>									
Average									NA	Unknown